

River Court, Mill Lane, Godalming, Surrey GU7 1EZ, UK

Email: elena.lara@ciwf.org

To:

Mr. Luis Planas Puchades Mrs. Diana Morant

Mrs. Maria Jesús Montero Cuadrado

In copy:

Prime Minister Pedro Sánchez Pérez-Castejón

October 8, 2024

Dear Mr. Luis Planas, Mrs. Diana Morant, and Mrs. María Jesús Montero Cuadrado:

We, the groups, scientists and organisations signing this letter, are writing to express our deepest concern regarding the significant amount of public funds that the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, the Ministry of Finance and Public Service, and the Ministry of Science and Innovation has invested and continues to invest in the development of octopus farming in Spain.

Recently, Compassion in World Farming conducted a <u>global investigation into government funding</u> of industrial octopus farming around the world. The results show that Spain has spent the most public funds on the development of intensive octopus farming, investing at least **€9.7 million** of taxpayers' money in this cruel and unsustainable practice. Moreover, Spain is close to becoming the first country to open the world's first commercial octopus farm in the Canary Islands—another worrying initiative that the Government still has time to prevent from becoming a reality.

In recent years, there has been growing opposition to the development of octopus farming from scientists, animal protection NGOs, environmental organisations, and society at large. Additionally, several Members of the European Parliament have expressed their opposition to octopus farming, bringing the issue to the European Parliament and the European Commission. The United States has pioneered legislative action on this issue; in March 2024, Washington became the first state to legally ban octopus farming. California followed suit, including in its law a ban on the import of farmed octopus. Furthermore, the OCTOPUS Act 2024, if successful, will prohibit commercial octopus farming and the import of farmed octopus throughout the United States.

There is strong scientific evidence to support concerns that introducing these animals into intensive production systems would not only be cruel but would also cause environmental damage. Compassion in World Farming published a report in 2021 called <u>"Octopus Factory Farming: A Recipe for Disaster"</u>, which outlines the scientific evidence and is summarised below.

It has been scientifically proven that octopuses are solitary animals by nature (1); therefore, they will not adapt to the high-density conditions typical of intensive production systems. Octopuses are highly intelligent animals that will not be able to express their natural behaviours when confined in sterile tanks and controlled environments (2,3). Most importantly, there is currently no scientifically validated method for the humane slaughter of octopuses (4). The planned method for slaughtering these animals is to place them in tanks containing ice water (5). This is despite it being scientifically demonstrated that this method,

used for other aquatic animals like fish, without prior stunning, is inhumane (6), as it causes considerable pain, fear, suffering, and a highly prolonged death (7).

In light of the suffering involved in the farming and slaughter of octopuses, the Spanish Government's use of public funds to support the development of octopus farming is incompatible with Article 13 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the EU. This requires the Member States, in formulating and implementing fisheries and agriculture policies, to 'pay full regard to the welfare requirements of animals'. Octopus farming and the planned slaughter method pay no regard to the animals' welfare.

Octopus farming is also unsustainable. Octopuses are carnivorous animals so farming them requires feeding them with animal protein (8). Thus, octopus farming would necessitate capturing large quantities of fish or other marine organisms to feed the farmed octopuses, further aggravating ocean overfishing (9,10). Moreover, other environmental risks and impacts associated with octopus farms have been described, such as those that the proposed farm in Las Palmas de Gran Canaria may have including marine pollution, biodiversity loss, and public health risks (11).

A poll commissioned this year by Compassion in World Farming and Eurogroup for Animals showed that almost 8 out of 10 people polled in nine EU countries think that when public money is used to fund aquatic animals farming, the money should only support farms that are sustainable. In Spain, an overwhelming 83% of people agree (12). In light of such strong international public, scientific, and political opposition to industrial octopus farming, we urge you to reconsider your government's support for this practice. We call on you to commit to allocating no further funds for the development of octopus farming in Spain due to animal cruelty, environmental risks, and the negative impact it may have on Spain's international reputation. Your government should instead move investment away from factory farming, ban octopus farms, and move towards sustainable food systems that benefit animals, people and our planet.

We look forward to receiving your response and would welcome the opportunity to meet with you to discuss this issue in more detail and to address any questions you may have.

Dra. Elena Lara

Senior Research and Policy Advisor, Compassion in World Farming

Signatories

Acción Océanos Animal Interfaith Alliance Animal Legal Defense Fund Animal Rights Initiative Animals Aotearoa AnimaNaturalis Animavida, asociación protectora de animales y medio ambiente Animal Save Movement Antropología de la Vida Animal - Grupo de Estudios de Etnozoología Aquatic Life Institute **Better Food Foundation BLOOM** Capital V Catholic Concern for Animals Compassion in World Farming Conservation Collective Deep Rising Movie **DEPANA** Ekō Empatía Essere Animali **Ethical Seafood Research Eurogroup for Animals** FAADA (Fundación para el Asesoramiento y Acción en Defensa de los Animales) Finnish Animal Rights Law Society Fish Welfare Initiative Fórum Nacional de Proteção e Defesa Animal Generation Vegan (GenV) Green Futures Green REV Institute Humane Action Pennsylvania In Defense of Animals Indian Vegetarians and Vegans KYMA sea conservation & research L214

La Fondation Droit Animal, Éthique et Sciences (LFDA)

Lady Freethinker
Loowatt Ltd
Menorca Preservation
Mercy for Animals
Mission blue
Montréal SPCA
MTÜ Loomus
Observatorio de Bienestar Animal
Ocean Culture Life
OneKind
PACMA
PETA UK (People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals)
PETA Deutschland e.V.
Plant Based Treaty
Ocean Born Foundation
Project 1882
Raíces & Brotes España
Rivenmoor Ltd.
Sea Shepherd France
SINTIENTES
Social Compassion in Legislation
The Humane League US
Think.fish
Tindakan
Unión Vegetariana Española
Voters For Animal Rights
We Animals
Welfarm
World Animal Justice
World Animal Protection
Andrew Knight, Murdoch University School of Veterinary Medicine, UK
Becca Franks, New York University
Carol Royle
Dr. Aude Kleiber, PhD in Fish Welfare, Behavior and Cognition
Dr James Dyke, University of Exeter
Dr Marc Abraham OBE, BVM&S MRCVS
Dr Alan McElligott, City University of Hong Kong

Dr Marta Tafalla, Senior Lecturer at Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona

Dr Richard Twine, Reader in Sociology, Edge Hill University, UK

Dr Walter Veit, University of Reading

Enrico Spacone

Fabiola Leyton Donoso, Prof. Lectora en Ética y Legislación, Fac. Enfermería

Gonzalo Perez-Rosales, PhD. Hong Kong University of Science and Technology

Heather Browning, University of Southampton

Jennifer Jacquet, University of Miami

Dame Joanna Lumley

Michel Pimbert, Director of the Centre for Agroecology and Food Security (CAFS) at Coventry University

Peter Singer, Ira W. DeCamp Professor of Bioethics in the University Center for Human Values at Princeton University

Prof. Amir Kassam OBE. University of Reading, United Kingdom

Prof. Dave Goulson, University of Sussex

Prof. David L. Clough, Chair in Theology and Applied Sciences, University of Aberdeen

Prof. Emeritus Toby Knowles, University of Bristol

Prof. Jonathan Birch, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE)

Prof. L Dickel, Univ. Caen Normandy

Prof. Lynne Sneddon, University of Gothenburg

Prof. Marc Bekoff, Professor Emeritus University of Colorado

Prof. Tim Lang, Professor Emeritus of Food Policy, University of London

Rebeca Niemiec. Colorado State University Animal-Human Policy Center

Dr Shireen Kassam, MBBS, PhD. Plant-Based Health Professionals UK

Silvia Caprioglio Panizza, University of Pardubice

Sir David Madden. Vice-Chair of Compassion in World Farming. Honorary Antonian at St Antony's College, University of Oxford

References

- 1. Mather JA, Scheel D. Behaviour. In: Iglesias J, Fuentes L, Villanueva R, editors. Cephalopod Culture [Internet]. Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands; 2014 [cited 2020 Oct 7]. p. 17–39. Available from: http://link.springer.com/10.1007/978-94-017-8648-5
- 2. Mather, Anderson RC, Wood JB. Octopus: The Ocean's Intelligent Invertebrate [Internet]. 1st ed. Portland, London: Timber Press; 2010 [cited 2020 Oct 7]. Available from: https://books.google.nl/books?hl=nl&lr=&id=m-
 <a href="https://books.google.nl/books.google.
- 3. Mather JA, Dickel L. Cephalopod complex cognition. Vol. 16, Current Opinion in Behavioral Sciences. Elsevier Ltd; 2017. p. 131–7.
- 4. Andrews PLR, Darmaillacq AS, Dennison N, Gleadall IG, Hawkins P, Messenger JB, et al. The identification and management of pain, suffering and distress in cephalopods, including anaesthesia, analgesia and humane killing. J Exp Mar Bio Ecol. 2013;447:46–64.
- 5. Compassion in World Farming, Eurogroup for Animals. Uncovering the horrific reality of octopus farming. 2023.
- 6. Lines JA, Spence J. Humane harvesting and slaughter of farmed fish. Rev sci tech Off int Epiz. 2014;
- 7. Poli BM, Parisi G, Scappini F, Zampacavallo G. Fish welfare and quality as affected by pre-slaughter and slaughter management. Aguac Int. 2005;13(1–2):29–49.
- 8. Jacquet J, Franks B, Godfrey-Smith P, Sánchez-Suárez W. The Case Against Octopus Farming. Issues Sci Technol. 2019;37–44.
- 9. Alder J, Campbell B, Karpouzi V, Kaschner K, Pauly D. Forage fish: From ecosystems to markets. Annu Rev Environ Resour [Internet]. 2008 [cited 2019 Feb 15]:33:153–66. Available from: http://www.fishbase.org.
- Naylor RL, Goldburg RJ, Primavera JH, Kautsky N, Beveridge MCM, Clay J, et al. Effect of aquaculture on world fish supplies [Internet]. Vol. 405, Nature. Nature Publishing Group; 2000 [cited 2019 Feb 6]. p. 1017– 24. Available from: http://www.nature.com/articles/35016500
- 11. Eurogroup for Animals C in WF. Exposing the environmental risks of octopus farming. 2024.
- 12. Compassion in World Farming. (2024, September). 9 out of 10 people across Europe want better protection for farmed fish. [Online]. Available: https://www.ciwf.eu/media-and-news/news/2024/09/9-out-of-10-people-across-europe-want-better-protection-for-farmed-fish. [Accessed: October 2, 2024].